

T: 617.330.7000 F: 617.330.7550 50 Rowes Wharf, Boston, MA 02110

Lauren A. Liss Direct Dial: 617-330-7126 E-mail: LLiss@rubinrudman.com

November 1, 2013

<u>Via Electronic Mail</u> <u>And U.S. Mail</u>

James E. Belsky, BWP Permit Chief MassDEP, Northeast Regional Office 205B Lowell Street Wilmington, MA 01887

> Re: Comments on Proposed Air Quality Plan Approval And Draft Prevention of Significant Deterioration Permit Salem Harbor Redevelopment Project (the "Project") <u>Transmittal Number X254064</u>

Dear Mr. Belsky:

On behalf of Footprint Power Salem Harbor Redevelopment LP (the "Applicant"), I am pleased to submit the following comments regarding the Proposed Air Quality Plan Approval and Draft Prevention of Significant Deterioration (PSD) Permit dated September 9, 2013.

Throughout the development and permitting processes, the Applicant has strived to ensure that the proposed Project will result in a state of the art facility that provides both needed electric generation capacity as well as important environmental benefits. Indeed, the Applicant has been engaging in continuing discussions with its equipment vendors to ensure that these goals are achieved. As a result of these discussions, the Applicant can now report that it has obtained revised, *lower* particulate matter emission guarantees from its turbine vendor General Electric Company (GE). Please note that nothing has changed in the physical configuration or operations of the equipment; rather, the reductions described in this letter result from the supplier's willingness to offer more stringent guarantees.

Specifically, GE will now guarantee filterable plus condensable particulate stack emissions for operating loads greater than MECL at: 8.8 pounds per hour/unit for no duct firing; and 13.0 pounds per hour for duct firing. (The current draft permit limit in lb/hr for both unfired and duct fired conditions is 15.5 lb/hr.) This, in turn, results in a reduced emissions limit for the proposed Project's maximum lb/MMBtu of PM/PM10/PM2.5 for all unfired conditions above MECL of 0.0071 lb/MMBtu (reduced from 0.0088), and for duct fired conditions above MECL of 0.0062 lb/MMBtu (reduced from 0.0067 lb/MMBtu). Likewise, at full load unfired conditions, the Project's PM/PM10/PM2.5 emissions now range from 0.0038 lb/MMBtu at 0 °F to 0.0047 lb/MMBtu at 105 °F. Furthermore, at full load unfired conditions the Project's James E. Belsky, BWP Permit Chief November 1, 2013 Page 2

PM/PM10/PM2.5 will be 0.029 (reduced from 0.044) and with duct firing 0.041 (reduced from 0.049). Finally, the PM/PM10/PM2.5 maximum facility potential to emit in tons per year (TPY) will be 82.0 TPY (reduced from 109.4 TPY). This results in a 25% reduction in potential to emit particulate matter.

The facility maximum ambient impacts remain based on our prior more conservative particulate emissions

Accordingly, the Applicant requests that the final air plan approval and PSD permit reflect the reductions in particulate matter emissions described above. Attached to this letter are proposed revised, red-lined versions of Table 7 from the Proposed Air Quality Plan Approval and Table 2 from the Draft PSD Permit showing these reductions.

Sincerely,

Lauren A. Liss

LAL/dm

cc: Mr. Scott G. Silverstein
 Mr. Edward J. Braczyk, Environmental Engineer
 Mr. Cosmo Buttaro, Environmental Engineer
 Mr. Keith H. Kennedy
 Mr. George S. Lipka

Footprint Power Salem Harbor Development LP Draft PSD Permit Transmittal No. X254064 Application No. NE-12-022 Page 6 of 25

		Table 2	
EU# ()	Operational / Production Limit	Air Contaminant	- Emission Limit
EU1, EU2	Operation at \geq MECL, ⁽¹⁷⁾ excluding start-ups and shutdowns	VOC (no duct firing), as Methane (CH ₄)	$\leq 3.0 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0013 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 1.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.009 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
	Fuel Heat Input Rate of each EU: ≤ 2,449 MMBtu per hour, HHV	VOC (duct firing), as Methane (CH ₄)	$ \leq 5.4 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0022 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 1.7 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.016 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)} $
	Natural Gas shall be the only fuel of use. Fuel Heat Input of each EU:	S in Fuel SO ₂ (no duct firing)	
	≤ 18,888,480 MMBtu, HHV per 12-month rolling period ⁽⁹⁾	SO ₂ (duct firing)	$\leq 3.7 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0015 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.3 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ < 0.011 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)} \end{cases}$
		H ₂ SO ₄ (no duct firing)	$\leq 2.3 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0010 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.1 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% O_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.007 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)}$
		H ₂ SO₄ (duct firing)	$\leq 2.3 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0010 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.1 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.008 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)}$
		PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5} (no duct firing)	$ \leq \frac{15.58.8}{60071} \text{ lb/hr}^{(1, 2, 8)} $ $ \leq 0.0088.0071 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1, 8)} $ $ \leq 0.044.029 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1, 2, 8, 10, -1)} $
		PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5} (duct firing)	$\leq \frac{15.513.0}{100000000000000000000000000000000000$
		NH3 (no duct firing)	$ \leq 6.6 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0027 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 2.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.019 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
		NH3 (duct firing)	$\leq 6.6 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0027 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 2.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ \leq 0.020 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)}$
		Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2e}	$ \leq 825 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(11)} \\ \leq 895 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(16)} $

Footprint Power Salem Harbor Development LP Draft PSD Permit Transmittal No. X254064 Application No. NE-12-022 Page 9 of 25

		Table 2	
EU#	Operational / Production	Air Contaminant	Emission Limit,
	Limit		\leq 2.44 lb/hr ⁽⁶⁾
EU5	\leq 300 hours of operation	NO _x and VOC (NMHC as	≤ 2.44 lb/m ≤ 3.0 gm/bhp-hr ⁽⁶⁾
	per 12-month rolling period	CH _{1.8}),	\leq 3.0 gm/KW-hr ⁽⁶⁾
		Combined Total	$\leq 2.14 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$
	Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel	CO	$\leq 2.6 \text{ gm/bhp-hr}^{(6)}$
	Fuel Oil shall be the only fuel of use.		$\leq 2.0 \text{ gm/ohp-m}$ $\leq 3.5 \text{ gm/KW-hr}^{(6)}$
	luer of use.	S in Fuel	$\leq 0.0015\%$ by weight
	< 200 hours of operation	So ₂	$\leq 0.004 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$
	\leq 300 hours of operation per 12-month rolling period		$\leq 0.0003 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$
	per 12-month forming period	PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5}	$\leq 0.12 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$
	Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel	F IVU F IVI (0) F IVI 2.5	≤ 0.15 gm/bhp-hr ⁽⁶⁾
	Fuel Oil shall be the only		$\leq 0.2 \text{ gm/KW-hr}^{(6)}$
	fuel of use.	Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2c}	< 162.85 lb/MMBtu
		Opacity	< 5%, except 5% to < 10% for
1			< 2 minutes during any one hour
EU1, EU2,	NA	Smoke	310 CMR 7.06 (1)(a)
EU3, EU4,			
EU5			
Facility-Wide	NA	NO _x	\leq 144.8 TPY ⁽⁷⁾
-		СО	\leq 106.4 TPY ⁽⁷⁾
		VOC	$\leq 28.0 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$
		SO ₂	≤ 28.8 TPY ⁽⁷⁾
		PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5}	$\leq \frac{109.482.0}{109.482.0}$ TPY ^(7, 8)
ų ·		NH ₃	\leq 51.0 TPY (7)
		H ₂ SO ₄	$\leq 18.8 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$
		Pb	$\leq 0.00013 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$
		Formaldehyde or Single HAP	$\leq 6.6 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$
		Total HAPs	$\leq 13.1 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$
		CO ₂	\leq 2,277,333 TPY ⁽⁷⁾
		Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2e}	\leq 2,279,530 TPY ⁽⁷⁾

Table 2 Notes:

1. Emission limits are one hour block averages and do not apply during start-ups and shutdowns.

2. Emission rates are based on burning natural gas in any one combustion turbine at a maximum natural gas firing rate of 2,449 MMBtu/hr, HHV, at 90 °F ambient temperature, 14.7 psia ambient pressure, and 60% ambient relative humidity (combustion turbine and duct burner combined). These constitute worst case emissions.

3. Start-ups include the time from flame-on in the combustor (after a period of downtime) until the minimum emissions compliance load (MECL) is reached. Shutdowns include the time from dropping below the MECL until flame-out.

4. Emission limits represent worst case emissions for cold start-ups. Emissions for warm and hot start-ups are

Footprint Power Salem Harbor Development LP Proposed Plan Approval Transmittal No. X254064 Application No. NE-12-022 Page 24 of 59

		Table 7	
EU#	Operational / Production	Air Contaminant	Emission Limit
EU1, EU2	Deration at ≥ MECL, ⁽¹⁷⁾ excluding start-ups and shutdowns	VOC (no duct firing), as Methane (CH ₄)	$ \leq 3.0 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} $ $ \leq 0.0013 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} $ $ \leq 1.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} $ $ \leq 0.009 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
	Fuel Heat Input Rate of each EU: ≤ 2,449 MMBtu per hour, HHV	VOC (duct firing), as Methane (CH ₄)	$\leq 5.4 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \leq 0.0022 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \leq 1.7 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \leq 0.016 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)}$
	Natural Gas shall be the only fuel of use. Fuel Heat Input of each EU: ≤ 18,888,480 MMBtu, HHV per 12-month rolling period ⁽⁹⁾	S in Fuel SO ₂ (no duct firing)	$ \leq 0.5 \text{ grains/100 scf} \leq 3.7 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \leq 0.0015 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \leq 0.3 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% O_2^{(1)} \leq 0.010 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
		SO ₂ (duct firing)	$\leq 3.7 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)}$ $\leq 0.0015 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)}$ $\leq 0.3 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% O_2^{(1)}$ $< 0.011 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)}$
		H ₂ SO ₄ (no duct firing)	$ \leq 2.3 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} $ $ \leq 0.0010 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} $ $ \leq 0.1 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} $ $ \leq 0.007 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
		H ₂ SO ₄ (duct firing)	$\leq 2.3 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \leq 0.0010 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \leq 0.1 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \leq 0.008 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)}$
		PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5} (no duct firing)	$ \leq \frac{15.58.8}{\le} \text{ lb/hr}^{(1, 2, 8)} $ $ \leq 0.0088.0071 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1, 8)} $ $ \leq 0.044.029 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1, 2, 8, 10)} $ $ = \frac{14}{14} $
		PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5} (duct firing)	$\leq 0.0067 - 0.0062$ lb/MMBtu ^(1, *) < 0.049 - 0.041 lb/MW-hr ^(1, 2, 8, 1)
		NH ₃ (no duct firing)	$ \leq 6.6 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0027 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 2.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ < 0.019 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,10,14)} $
		NH ₃ (duct firing)	$ \begin{vmatrix} \leq 6.6 \text{ lb/hr}^{(1,2)} \\ \leq 0.0027 \text{ lb/MMBtu}^{(1)} \\ \leq 2.0 \text{ ppmvd} @ 15\% \text{ O}_2^{(1)} \\ < 0.020 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(1,2,15)} \end{vmatrix} $
		Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2e}	$ \leq 825 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(11)} \\ \leq 895 \text{ lb/MW-hr}^{(16)} $

Table 7				
EU#	Operational / Production		Emission Limit	
THE THE	Limit	NO _x and VOC (NMHC as	\leq 2.44 lb/hr ⁽⁶⁾	
EU5	\leq 300 hours of operation	$CH_{1.8}$),	$\leq 3.0 \text{ gm/bhp-hr}^{(6)}$	
	per 12-month rolling period	Combined Total	$\leq 4.0 \text{ gm/KW-hr}^{(6)}$	
	Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel	CO	$\leq 2.14 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$	
	Fuel Oil shall be the only		≤ 2.6 gm/bhp-hr ⁽⁶⁾	
	fuel of use.		$\leq 3.5 \text{ gm/KW-hr}^{(6)}$	
	fuel of use.	S in Fuel	$\leq 0.0015\%$ by weight	
	\leq 300 hours of operation	SO ₂	< 0.004 lb/hr ⁽⁶⁾	
	per 12-month rolling period		≤ 0.0003 lb/hr ⁽⁶⁾	
	per 12-month forming period	PM/PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5}	$\leq 0.12 \text{ lb/hr}^{(6)}$	
	Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel	1 100 1 101[01 1012.5	≤ 0.15 gm/bhp-hr ⁽⁶⁾	
	Fuel Oil shall be the only		$\leq 0.2 \text{ gm/KW-hr}^{(6)}$	
	fuel of use.	Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2e}	< 162.85 lb/MMBtu	
		Opacity Opacity	< 5%, except 5% to $< 10%$ for	
			≤ 2 minutes during any one hour	
EU1, EU2,	NA	Smoke	310 CMR 7.06 (1)(a)	
EU3, EU4,		<u>Smoke</u>		
EU5				
Facility-Wide	NA	NO _x	\leq 144.8 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		СО	< 106.4 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		VOC	$\leq 28.0 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$	
		SO ₂	$\leq 28.8 \text{ TPY}^{(7)}$	
		PM/PM10/PM2.5	$\leq \frac{109.482.0}{109.482.0}$ TPY (7,8)	
		NH ₃	\leq 51.0 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		H ₂ SO ₄	< 18.8 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		Pb	\leq 0.00013 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		Formaldehyde or Single HAP	\leq 6.6 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		Total HAPs	\leq 13.1 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		CO ₂	≤ 2,277,333 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	
		Greenhouse Gases, CO _{2e}	\leq 2,279,530 TPY ⁽⁷⁾	

Table 7 Notes:

1. Emission limits are one hour block averages and do not apply during start-ups and shutdowns.

2. Emission rates are based on burning natural gas in any one combustion turbine at a maximum natural gas firing rate of 2,449 MMBtu/hr, HHV, at 90 °F ambient temperature, 14.7 psia ambient pressure, and 60% ambient relative humidity (combustion turbine and duct burner combined). These constitute worst case emissions.

3. Start-ups include the time from flame-on in the combustor (after a period of downtime) until the minimum emissions compliance load (MECL) is reached. Shutdowns include the time from dropping below the MECL until flame-out.

4. Emission limits represent worst case emissions for cold start-ups. Emissions for warm and hot start-ups are